

Appendix 3: Trends and Exemplar Research report



Trends Research/Exemplars

City of Vancouver Update to Key Gaps in Cultural Infrastructure

May 2017 (Updated September 2017)

AMS Planning & Research Corp.

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Calgary	3
Toronto	7
Seattle	10
San Francisco	13
Other Organizations	15
Contacts	18
Research Reports	19
Appendix A	22

Introduction

As Vancouver real estate values continue to escalate, non-profit arts and culture organizations and artists find it increasingly difficult to afford and build equity in space. Cities across Canada and the U.S. are facing similar issues; AMS examined emerging trends and models impacting the development of space for arts and

culture in several comparable cities – Calgary, Toronto, Seattle and San Francisco.

Most major cities that have developed a Cultural Plan have identified as part of this plan, specific goals and priorities for developing creative spaces. Providing affordable and accessible spaces for artists to live, work, teach, produce, exhibit, and perform is seen as a key component of overall city planning and economic development goals – creating a vibrant cultural sector is essential to creating a vibrant city.

Some tools have been around for years – zoning provisions and regulations, tax credits and incentives, development bonuses that promote arts and culture development – and they continue to be used successfully in some cities.

Recognizing the need to help individual artists and arts organizations with space needs, city arts and cultural departments have begun offering technical assistance programs, like online space matching services, networking opportunities, workshops, webinars, publications, and toolkits to help artists and organizations understand and navigate the complexities of real estate, tenant/landlord issues, and business

practices. (SpaceFinder from Fractured Atlas, is an example of a successful and rapidly expanding online space matching service found in a growing number of American and Canadian cities.)

In Vancouver, the Social Purpose Real Estate (SPRE) Collaborative has been engaging in these issues for the broader community of non-profit organizations who need assistance with real estate needs. The SPRE Collaborative works to enhance the sustainability, capacity, and assets of this sector. Their efforts include a 2013 report on space needs, with specific sections on the cultural sector and independent artists. Their website includes useful online links to resources, toolkits, and a space matching service, a version of SpaceFinder called “Have Space Need Space.”

Private non-profit developers who specialize in developing creative spaces collaborate with cities’ cultural departments to achieve shared goals of providing space for artists and cultural organizations (live/work spaces, collaborative and community spaces, arts incubators).

Trends in developing space for arts and culture occur in tandem with related city planning and economic

development goals – adaptive reuse of neglected or historic buildings, neighborhood revitalization, cultural tourism, increasing visibility of and access to arts and culture for underserved populations.

Many of these efforts are centered on “creative placemaking” -- using arts and culture to advance community development goals (affordable housing, community revitalization, economic growth, etc.). The end results may be the same – artist live/work spaces or community centers with co-working/office space for arts organizations – but the priority is on community development. The focus is on using arts and culture as a mechanism to address broader community needs, not simply advancing the arts and culture sector for the sake of improving access to arts and culture.

Partnerships are a key component to arts facility development efforts, including public-private and cross-sector partnerships. Funding for most creative space initiatives comes from an amalgamation of sources – foundation grants, bank financing, community development banks, government programs – including low-income and historic tax credits. In the U.S. for example, the NEA Our Town grant program (which

provides matching grants up to \$200,000 for creative placemaking projects) requires at least one government entity and one nonprofit organization, with one of the partners having an arts and culture focus. Additional partners across all sectors, although not required, are encouraged.

Issues faced by arts and culture organizations are often part of the larger nonprofit environment, which faces the same space affordability challenges. Making arts space development part of a larger discussion about non-profit and social purpose real estate issues, and convening partners to address these overall issues can be a way to get arts facilities development on the larger public agenda. In contrast to a strategy of including arts with all nonprofits, some collaborative efforts focus solely on arts and culture organizations -- including for-profit businesses (small galleries or music venues, for example) as well as nonprofits. Small businesses in the cultural sector also struggle with space affordability; convening for-profit entities alongside the non-profits can help all work toward common solutions.

Even after successful developments have been put in place, affordability issues can still remain – particularly

with the prospect of escalating property taxes that can be a burden to nonprofits arts organizations. This is an issue in Toronto and Ontario due to tax assessments based on “highest and best use,” rather than current use. The City of Toronto is working with provincial government to change tax policy for properties that house cultural agencies and activities, so that property taxes don’t serve as disincentives to arts and culture development. Current tax assessments encourage developers to sell and build to the “highest and best use” – luxury condos, rather than affordable rental spaces for artists, especially in hot real estate markets like some Toronto neighborhoods. This is an issue Vancouver may need to be aware of, as well.

Calgary

Calgary Arts Development Authority (CADA), established 2004

Mission: Calgary Arts Development supports and strengthens the arts to benefit all Calgarians

Vision: A creative, connected Calgary through the arts

We invest and allocate municipal funding for the arts provided by The City of Calgary and leverage these funds to provide additional resources to the arts sector.

We are a connector, facilitator, collaborator, champion, supporter, amplifier, investor, catalyst and opportunity-maker.

(CADA, Calgary's designated arts development authority, is separate from the city's Arts & Culture Division, which is primarily responsible for the Calgary's public art program, and festivals and events.)

Initiatives/Programs

cSPACE

In partnership with the Calgary Foundation CADA created cSPACE in 2011 to address the space needs for artists and non-profits to connect and collaborate. They are developing affordable, sustainable and collaborative workspaces, with funding from government, foundations, individual donors, and the private sector. (These projects have also been partially funded through CMSI funds, identified through the CSIP evaluation process – described below.)

<http://www.cspaceprojects.com/>

Two current projects:

- King Edward Arts Hub & Incubator: 41,000sf, below-market creation, production, exhibition and performance space, in rehabbed school building, available for long-term lease
- ArtsCoLAB: affordable, short to medium-term desk rental and shared office and meeting space for artists and creative sector workers, non-profit and charitable organizations; managed by cSPACE Projects in partnership with Calgary Arts Development

Artists in the Workplace

Created in 2015 in partnership with the Calgary Chamber, Artists in the Workplace connects businesses that have extra space with artists and arts organizations looking for workspace. Businesses that participate in the program collect nominal rents and are eligible for tax benefits for supporting the arts. CADA works with businesses to promote the benefits available for offering space to artists and organizations. Artists submit an

Expression of Interest. Available spaces are listed and described on the CADA website.

Example of a partnership with a private building owner: Shell Employees' Credit Union's downtown office offered space to arts organizations, to provide Calgarians working or living downtown with opportunities to engage in the arts, while enhancing the leaseholder's social responsibility reputation. Shell Employees' Credit Union selects the winning bid, based on an application, which includes information on how the arts organization will engage Calgarians who work in the oil and gas industry, and the ability to offer charitable tax receipt to the leaseholder.

Although this program has been successful, there have been some challenges in filling the spaces. There were actually more responses from businesses offering space than from arts organizations wanting space. Businesses often wanted more in rent (even though at reduced rates) than artists could afford. The places that worked most successfully were raw, light industrial spaces, primarily used for rehearsal space.

The Artists in the Workplace Program is being transitioned to SpaceFinder (which they recently launched in 2016). A grant from the Alberta Real Estate Foundation helped fund the costs of setting up SpaceFinder and encouraging venues to sign up. (The Real Estate Foundation supports a variety of public non-profit space initiatives, not just cultural -- an example of exploring partnerships beyond the cultural sector.) CADA likes the versatility and granularity of SpaceFinder and have found it easier to reach critical mass with the number of listings.

Grants

Cultural Space Investment Process (CSIP)

CADA created this mechanism in 2008 to evaluate cultural facility projects for city funding. The Cultural Space Investment Process, CSIP (formerly called the Art Space Investment Process), is an evaluation process to identify priorities to The City of Calgary for cultural infrastructure projects, with grants given for up to 25% of total capital costs, so that public funds are leveraged 3:1 (with 75% from other fundraising efforts).

Projects are rated on factors such as compelling vision, advanced readiness, strong feasibility, and sustainability. CSIP is an assessment process that projects must go through to get city funding through the City's Cultural Municipal Sustainability Initiative (CMSI), the cultural portion of provincial MSI funds, which support local infrastructure projects. Projects recommended by CSIP assessors are added to the City's Culture, Parks and Recreation Infrastructure Investment Plan.

The evaluation process (arms-length, independent, defined criteria) has been extremely useful in setting priorities and can be transferred to other programs as a way to develop and evaluate cultural facility funding priorities. After receiving recommendations, the city performs its own due diligence evaluation to ensure financial and operational sustainability of projects.

In 2008 Calgary City Council committed 5% of their MSI funds to cultural infrastructure over the next 10 years (a total of \$165m over 10 years). While the program has been a success, funds were allocated for a specific time span, and CADA staff are in the process of planning for how to pay for priorities after the funding stream ends

Projects funded through this process have ranged from large marquee facilities (Taylor Centre for the Performing Arts, National Music Centre, Canada Sports Hall of Fame) to smaller, community/artist-based facilities (Folk Festival Hall, DJD Dance Centre, King Edward School Arts Incubator).

Other Services

Arts Spaces Networking Nights; website filled with numerous links, resources, and technical advice

Future Trends

Future trends in Calgary point to co-location of arts groups with other community organizations – especially in faith-based and educational spaces during times when they are not being used by congregants and students. Unique to Calgary is the city's network of many neighborhood Community Halls, owned by the City, but managed by local community associations. Programs in each Community Hall vary as each neighborhood has its own priorities, but partnerships

are beginning to develop between Community Halls and arts organizations. An arts group may get space (at no or minimal cost) for its programs, in return for managing the Hall. The number of these neighborhood-focused sites is unique to Calgary, but the partnership idea can serve as a model. Arts organizations partnering with community centers, recreation centers, schools or churches that might have extra space get the benefit of being embedded within a neighborhood, and patrons who don't want to travel to a downtown arts district may appreciate having cultural opportunities closer to home.

Toronto

Arts & Culture Services

City government department with responsibility for running museums, historical sites, performing and visual arts centres, community cultural centres, and helping community arts organizations access municipal services and facilities

(Located within Economic Development & Culture department)

The Cultural Partnerships Unit works to increase the supply of affordable, accessible and sustainable cultural spaces, particularly outside the downtown core; and to develop space for emerging cultural enterprises, collaborating with commercial developers, public works projects, the City's Planning Division, and the Toronto Community Housing Corporation.

Initiatives/Programs

Bonusing incentives

Toronto's 2011 cultural plan emphasized the need for upgrades and development of facilities for arts organizations and community cultural groups as a "critical next step to ensure a vibrant cultural community." In their efforts to develop cultural space, Toronto staff identified Section 37 (a bonusing provision in Ontario's Planning Act that requires developers to contribute a community benefit in exchange for zoning variances in height/density) as an important tool to support creation of and improvements to cultural space.

Examples of arts/culture facility projects that resulted from Section 37 funding:

- Artscape Distillery Studios – opened 2003, 50,000sf, 63 below-market work and retail studios, offices, rehearsal and performance spaces; part of a larger redevelopment of Toronto’s Distillery District, using Section 37 funds from the private developer Cityscape, which owns the property and gives Artscape a below-market long-term lease for the space.
- Artscape Wychwood Barns – opened 2008, 60,000sf space in a former streetcar repair facility; houses 26 artist live/work spaces, 10 studios, programming and administrative space for artists and non-profit organizations, a community-run gallery; covered outdoor space for farmer’s markets, art markets, events. \$1m of \$22m total cost secured through Section 37 negotiations with the private developer working on a condo tower within the same ward. Owned by the City of Toronto, operated by Artscape.
- Artscape Triangle Lofts and Triangle Gallery – opened 2010, 56,000sf, affordable housing and gallery space for artists (48 below-market lofts and 20 affordable rental lofts); private developer Urbancorp was given additional height/density for

their market-rate condominiums in exchange for offering space to Artscape at construction cost.

Rental units owned by Artscape, condo units owned by artists/arts professionals.

- TIFF Bell Lightbox, opened 2010, headquarters for Toronto International Film Festival, with cinemas, galleries, studios, center for students and scholars, restaurant, public atrium; developer created the five floors of TIFF Bell Lightbox in exchange for permission to build a 42-story residential tower above.

While these projects have been extremely successful, the result has been that arts and culture developments happen only in wealthier neighborhoods where demand for other development is high. There is continuing concern with how to bring cultural spaces to other areas where the bonusing incentives are not in play.

Grants

Culture Build Investment Program

City-funded grants specifically for arts and culture facilities, first instituted by the City Council in 2002. The

grants provide matching funds to small and mid-size cultural organizations for repair and small capital projects (maximum award \$100,000). Applications are evaluated by an independent Peer Advisory Committee on factors of cultural merit, financial management, urgency of proposed repairs/renovations, and community access and outreach.

2016 awards totaled \$330,000 to 11 organizations, with amounts ranging from \$4,000 to \$70,000.

Other Arts Development Examples

401 Richmond

Private developer (Urbanspace) purchased in 1994 and transformed a historic warehouse in downtown into a thriving arts/culture hub, home to over 140 cultural producers and microenterprises; also a café, arts-enriched early learning centre, community courtyard. The development is currently under threat, however, due to rising property taxes.

Artscape

remains a major creative space developer in Toronto, with 10 current projects and more in development. They have partnered successfully with the City, accessing city incentives, funds, and assistance with things like permit exemptions and guaranteed, favorable loan rates, which have enabled the projects.

Future Trends

Toronto has made great strides in overall city-wide cultural planning, completing a cultural spaces inventory as a benchmark; priorities for the future will focus on smaller, more specialized planning -- neighborhood-level cultural plans and task forces for more specific subsets within the cultural sector (for example, they are starting a live music venue group and registry). They hope to be more proactive and effect change more easily by concentrating on more specific, local neighborhood issues. Partnerships with schools and other public buildings have begun to be explored, but these efforts have been slow, due to bureaucratic/insurance concerns. While all agree that it makes sense for arts groups to use a school after hours, in practice it is difficult to implement.

Seattle

Office of Arts & Culture

Mission: We activate and sustain Seattle through arts and culture

Vision: The Office of Arts & Culture envisions a city driven by creativity that provides the opportunity for everyone to engage in diverse arts and cultural experiences

Seattle has recently created within the city's Office of Arts and Culture, the Cultural Spaces Program, charged with preserving, creating and activating the city's cultural square footage. Since naming their first Cultural Space Liaison in 2013, they have concentrated their efforts on three constituencies: artists and arts organizations "to strengthen their role in charting the future of their creative spaces," developers and builders "to incorporate arts and culture into new projects," and property owners "to incentivize the preservation and expansion of arts and culture."

Initiatives/Programs

Cultural Space Inventory

Begun in 2013 and still ongoing, the database (available online) currently includes over 860 cultural spaces and serves as a framework for determining cultural space-related priorities and initiatives for the City.

Spacefinder Seattle

Online matching tool for artists and art spaces, Spacefinder Seattle is a database of rental spaces in the region available to artists and arts and cultural organizations. (365 listings, searchable by a wide variety of amenities, types of use, rates, etc.) [created by Seattle Office of Arts & Culture, not an affiliated SpaceFinder product]

ARTS at King Street Station

Development currently in process, a partnership of Seattle Office of Arts & Culture, Office of Economic Development and Department of Transportation to include a cultural hub on the upper floors with 17,000sf

of multi-disciplinary arts presentation spaces, public areas, community gathering spaces and offices.

The city purchased the 1908 train station in 2008 and has renovated the building (which continues to serve as an Amtrak station); currently planning underway to create an engagement plan for how best to allocate the cultural space on upper floors.

Funded through an increased admissions tax allocation (since 2010 75% of admissions tax funds have been allocated to fund the Office of Arts & Culture; this allocation was increased to 85% in 2016 to increase support for arts and culture and pay for this specific project)

Grants

Cultural Facilities Fund

offers capital funding to arts organizations through grants (up to \$50,000) for facility projects -- ADA compliance, renovations, new facility projects. The grants are designed to cover up to 50% of a project's total cost.

14 projects awarded funding in 2016, total funds given = \$240,000, with grants ranging from \$2,000 to \$35,000.

Projects are rated on: quality and urgency of the project in relation to the organization's mission; impact of the project and public benefit; feasibility and organizational capacity.

This fund, in existence since 2012, has grown since its initial allotment of \$150,000 to \$1 million in 2018, and has been considered quite successful in assisting arts organizations with facilities development. But, it still doesn't get to the core issue of displacement. Described as "rearranging the deck chairs on the Titanic" the fund helps organizations with facilities improvements, but they may ultimately lose spaces as rents keep rising. It also skews toward larger, more established organizations, because of the need to achieve a certain level of programming to be eligible for the grants.

Other Arts Development Examples

Artspace has created four developments in Seattle, but may have reached their saturation point, and probably will not be pursuing additional opportunities.

- Artspace Mt. Baker Lofts, opened 2014, 57 live/work spaces, cost \$18m
- Artspace Hiawatha Lofts, opened 2008, 61 live/work spaces, cost \$17m
- Tashiro Kaplan Artist Lofts /Tashiro Arts Building, opened 2004, 50 live/work spaces; 28 commercial arts-related galleries, studios, cost \$16.5m

Future Trends

Seattle's Cultural Spaces Program has begun focusing on access/ownership; even with facility and rental assistance, renting is ultimately a losing proposition for most nonprofit arts organizations. Just beginning their planning to achieve this goal, they have been looking to San Francisco as a model. The goal may be some form of cash rental assistance and technical assistance – helping to subsidize rents so that organizations can save

towards a down payment. The ultimate goal is ownership, so that occupancy costs can be stabilized, because Seattle rents continue to escalate quickly.

Efforts to encourage partnerships and co-locating have not worked in the past, mostly because Cultural Spaces Program staff tried to convene what they thought were like-minded organizations -- but in reality weren't. They've learned that the organizations need to come together on their own and agree to partner before exploring co-location options.

They have also been working with the City's Economic Development Office on a Commercial Space Affordability Task Force, exploring options for the broader market. Affordability is an issue not just for nonprofits, but for other small for-profit businesses in Seattle. (One idea: using a Public Development Authority, real estate entity supported by municipal government, to target specific development sectors – for example, cultural arts.)

Seattle Update

The Office of Arts & Culture recently released a comprehensive report, "The Cap Report," outlining steps

the city can take to “create, activate and preserve” cultural spaces. Their approach focuses on options from a menu of relatively small action items – from specific building code and permitting modifications to creating new technical assistance programs that compile and share funding sources and case studies. One of the more innovative ideas offered is to create a Cultural Certification program (modeled after LEED certification) for buildings and people.

By creating a range of actions to apply on multiple levels and in various scenarios, Seattle hopes to try numerous strategies to advance efforts to secure cultural space.

Appendix A summarizes the specific ideas offered by the report.

San Francisco

Community Arts Stabilization Trust (CAST)

Mission: to create stable physical spaces for arts and cultural organizations to facilitate equitable urban transformation

San Francisco’s Nonprofit Displacement Working Group, a part of the city’s Nonprofit Sustainability Initiative (founded to help find solutions for arts and social service nonprofits having difficulty finding affordable space), led to the creation of CAST in 2014. \$5 million from the Rainin Foundation in seed money helped create CAST, a real estate development and holding company, to address these needs – through technical assistance, grants, partnerships with city agencies and funders, and purchase/development of properties for arts organizations to lease to own.

Funding partners: Kenneth Rainin Foundation, Northern California Community Loan Fund, San Francisco Office of Economic and Workforce Development

CAST serves as a non-profit real estate and holding company, leasing space to an arts organization at below market rates, while the arts organization saves up enough to purchase the property at the initial purchase price.

Initiatives/Programs

Real Estate Developments

2 projects purchased and renovated by CAST, with arts organizations leasing to own:

- Luggage Store/509 Cultural Center – 6,000sf gallery space/multidisciplinary arts programming
- CounterPulse theater building – incubator for community-based arts and culture, with rental space for meetings, classes, rehearsals (but not public performances)

Technical assistance to arts organizations

Assistance with financial planning, space planning, lease/purchase negotiations, fundraising capacity development, facilities management

Although there is a space finding database in San Francisco, it is set up mainly for Performing Arts Spaces (a co-project of Theatre Bay Area and Dancers'Group).

Grants

Nonprofit Displacement Mitigation Program: financial assistance (up to \$75,000) for relocation costs, legal expenses, etc. awarded to social service and arts organizations (8 arts and 24 social service organizations

received funds in Dec 2016; 5 arts and 11 social service organizations received funding in April 2015)

Future Trends

CAST is currently expanding into Oakland with “Keeping Space–Oakland” grants: up to \$75,000 for arts organizations facing displacement, to help with real estate transactions for permanent affordable space.

CAST's efforts help: stabilize rents for arts/culture organizations by freezing real estate prices in an escalating market; increase financial and technical acumen of arts/culture organizations; assist arts/culture organizations with capitalization by helping them gain a permanent asset.

To accomplish these goals: they bring together multiple public and private partners; use a variety of financing (including New Market and Historic Tax Credits) to bring new capital to arts/culture facility projects.

San Francisco Nonprofit Sustainability Initiative is an overall initiative to help all nonprofits with space concerns; CAST developed as a specific way to target the

arts sector and they work in partnership with the city's larger nonprofit efforts.

Other Organizations

Private non-profit developers with cultural space projects located in our exemplar cities (and other locations):

Artscape, Toronto

a major player and frequent collaborator with the City of Toronto in developing creative spaces.

A not-for-profit urban development organization that makes space for creativity and transforms communities

BC Artscape is the Vancouver-based affiliate; they have just begun a community engagement planning process for their first project:

268 Keefer Street – 48,000sf, multi-tenant cultural hub with space for artists, arts organizations, community groups, flexible program space, public spaces; Artscape has long-term lease for three floors of Sun Wah building

Artspace, Minneapolis

a national leader in developing affordable artist spaces, though a combination of financing mechanisms, often through the use of low income housing and historic tax credits. Artspace owns and operates all of their projects, ensuring long-term affordability and viability, which they consider a key to their success.

Mission: to create, foster, and preserve affordable space for artists and arts organizations

Artsbuild Ontario, Kitchner

A non-profit arts service organization dedicated to realizing long-term solutions for building, managing and financing sustainable arts in Ontario communities. We provide organizations with training, tools and resources that support the development and management of creative spaces

Although not a developer, they offer useful resources and training opportunities for communities, artists, and cultural organizations to help address space needs.

Initiatives/Programs

SpaceFinder Canada

Matching tool for landlords and artist renters in specific communities and in provinces of Alberta, Manitoba, BC; searchable by location, type of space (rehearsal, studio art, exhibition, etc.), price per hour/day/week/month, and many other amenities and criteria

Asset Planner for the Arts

In partnership with Ameresco, an asset management/sustainability firm, and Walter Fedy, design/construction firm, offers a walk-thru and building inventory and learning webinars to teach arts organizations how to identify and develop facility issues, plans, budget forecasts. Minimal fees for the service, depending on the size of the facility

Arts Facilities Mentoring Network

Connects cultural leaders who are engaged in facilities issues with experienced mentors in their field for an initial workshop, and monthly discussions/meetings (up to three hours each month)

Bricks&Mortar – online searchable database of arts facilities, currently being created, as organizations register and enter information; they hope to use the data as a basis for advocacy for arts facilities investment.

Funding for the project from Department of Canadian Heritage and Ontario Trillium Foundation.

Resource Library

Example of a multi-disciplinary/cross-sector partnership:

ArtsBuild Ontario partnered with the Accelerator Centre and City of Kitchener to create 44 Gaukel, an affordable 11,000sf space for both artists and tech startups. Includes administrative space for local arts/culture organizations and artists, tech startups; rentable rehearsal space; opened Oct 2016

Other Examples not in our Exemplar Cities

Splendor, Amsterdam

A music venue founded and run by musicians in 2010; each of the 50 musicians contributes €1000 annually and agrees to play once a year. Members (about 1,000 in 2016) each pay €100 annually to be able to attend concerts for free. The musicians have access to the building anytime for rehearsals, performances, projects.

Two staff manage the building; volunteers help with tickets, concert set-up, and lighting. A committee of seven musicians provides oversight.

The building, a former bathhouse that was renovated to include two performances spaces, is leased from the city at a commercial rate. Initial funding for renovations was raised from private donors, each of whom were entitled to a private concert in exchange for their donation.

Splendor also offers music lessons, children's choir and concerts, and a Summer Academy for aspiring musicians, as well as private rentals, for additional revenue.

New York City

An assortment of tactics are being used in New York City to address the issue of affordable space, many are variations of what other cities are doing: space matching, zoning incentives, and partnerships among city agencies and private developers. Some examples: CUNY Dance Initiative offers empty rooms in CUNY's performing arts center to dancers and choreographers, through a competitive application process. Since its

launch in 2014, 67 residencies in 13 CUNY colleges have resulted.

Special Purpose District – 125th Street District was the first to offer an arts bonus to provide an incentive for the creation of visual or performing arts spaces. For buildings over 60,000sf, at least 5% of the development must be occupied by designated cultural uses.

City Department of Cultural Affairs partnered with the Mayor's Office, New York City Economic Development Corporation, and Housing Preservation and Development office to create an inter-agency task force, AREA (Affordable Real Estate for Artists) to work with real estate developers, housing agencies, and funders. The City committed \$30million in capital funding and the conversion of underutilized City-owned assets for projects.

Music Venue Trust, London

Founded in January 2014 “to protect the UK live music network by securing the long-term future of iconic Grassroots Music Venues.”

Their efforts include advocacy, technical assistance, and an annual conference, all aimed at achieving recognition that small/grassroots music venues are important cultural spaces, integral to the cultural life of London. They've authored two reports, "Understanding Small Music Venues" (March 2015) and "London's Grassroots Music Venues Rescue Plan" (October 2015) outlining challenges and offering solutions for small music venues struggling to stay afloat.

Individual music venues can join the Trade Association of the Music Venues Alliance (TAMVA), which offers technical assistance (with insurance, legal support, marketing, audience promotion, business planning, etc.). An Emergency Response Team advises venues facing threats (with an online form to request assistance). A new ticketing initiative, grassrootsvenues.tickets, launched in 2016, offering TAMVA membership to venues that sign on to use the ticketing service.

The Music Venue Trust is run by 1 full-time and 2 part-time staffers, and raising funds for their efforts remains challenging. After a recent application to Arts Council England was denied, they launched a fundraising campaign and concert, Fightback 2017.

Contacts

Calgary

Calgary Arts Development Authority (CADA)

Patti Pon, President & CEO, 402-264-5330, x103,
patti.pon@calgaryartsdevelopment.com

Joni Carroll, Arts Spaces Consultant , 403-264-5530 ext.
108, joni.carroll@calgaryartsdevelopment.com or

Toronto

Arts & Culture Services

Larry Ostola, Acting Director, 416-392-9135,
lostola@toronto.ca

Sally Han, Manager, Cultural Partnerships, 416-392-
4012

shan@toronto.ca

Seattle

Office of Arts & Culture

Matthew Richter, Cultural Space Liaison, 206-733-9955,
matthew.richter@seattle.gov

San Francisco

Community Arts Stabilization Trust (CAST)

Moy Eng, Executive Director, 415-556-9888,
meng@cast-sf.org

Artsbuild Ontario, Kitchner

Lindsay Golds, Executive Director, 519-880-3670 X102,
lindsay@artsbuildontario.ca

Splendor, Amsterdam

Norman va Dartel, business manager, 020-845 33 45,
info@splendoramsterdam.com

Music Venue Trust, London

Beverly Whitrick, Strategic Director, 07809 155 388,
beverly@musicvenue trust.com

Relevant Research Reports

Calgary

The Current State of Cultural Spaces for the Arts in Calgary Research Report, CADA, 2007

<http://calgaryartsdevelopment.com/living-a-creative-life/what-is-living-a-creative-life/summary/>

Reclaiming Calgary's Cultural Identity: Arts Spaces Strategy and Capital Plan, CADA, 2007

<http://calgaryartsdevelopment.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/ArtSpacesStrategy.pdf>

Living a Creative Life: An Arts Development Strategy for Calgary, CADA, March 2014

<http://calgaryartsdevelopment.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/LivingACreativeLife.pdf>

Toronto

Creative Capital Gains: An Action Plan for Toronto, City of Toronto Economic Development Committee and City Council, 2011

<http://www.torontoartsfoundation.org/tac/media/taf/Research/Foundation%20Publications/Creative-Capital-Gains-Report.pdf>

Making Space for Culture: Community Consultation Summaries, City of Toronto Cultural Services, 2014

http://www1.toronto.ca/City%20of%20Toronto/Economic%20Development%20&%20Culture/Cultural%20Services/Cultural%20Affairs/Cultural%20Planning/MakingSpace_complete_notaccessible.pdf

R.E. Millward & Associates and Lord Cultural Resources, Securing Cultural Benefits: Approaches to the Use of Section 37 for Arts and Cultural Facilities, 2013

Seattle

The CAP Report: 30 Ideas for the Creation, Activation & Preservation of Cultural Space, Office of Arts & Culture, Seattle, May 2017

<https://www.seattle.gov/Documents/Departments/Arts/Downloads/Space/CULTURAL%20SPACE%20REPORT.pdf>

Square Feet 2013 Wrap-Up Report, Office of Arts & Culture, Seattle, 2013

http://www.seattle.gov/Documents/Departments/Arts/Downloads/Space/Square_Feet_2013_Wrap_up.pdf

Cultural Space Seattle: Findings and Recommended Next Steps, Office of Arts & Culture, Seattle, 2012

http://www.seattle.gov/Documents/Departments/Arts/Downloads/Space/CSS_Report.pdf

San Francisco

Status of Bay Area Nonprofit Space & Facilities, Harder + Company, March 2016

https://ncg.org/sites/default/files/files/news/NCG_NPO_survey%20report.pdf

The Rainin Arts Real Estate Strategy, Kenneth Rainin Foundation, January 2017

http://krfoundation.org/krf/site-content/uploads/2017/02/RaininArtsRealEstate_WhitePaper.pdf

Other

Convergence Centres: Building Capacity for Innovation, Artscape, 2009

http://www.artscapediy.org/ArtscapeDIY/MediaLibrary/ArtscapeDIY/Archives/Artscape_Research/Convergence_Centres.pdf

Ann Markusen and Anne Gadwa, Creative Placemaking, NEA, 2010

<https://www.arts.gov/sites/default/files/CreativePlacemaking-Paper.pdf>

Anne Gadwa, How Artist Space Matter: Impacts and Insights from Three Case Studies, Metris Arts Consulting, 2010

<https://www.giarts.org/sites/default/files/How-Artist-Space-Matters.pdf>

Anne Gadwa and Anna Muessing, How Art Spaces Matter II, Metris Arts Consulting, 2012

http://metrisarts.com/wp-content/uploads/2012/06/1-HowArtSpacesMatter_II.pdf

The Art of Creative Placemaking: Lessons from 30 Years in the Field, Best Practices in Affordable Artist Housing, Artspace, 2014

<http://www.artspace.org/ideas-insights/artspace-publications/art-creative-placemaking-artspace-report>

Culture and Inclusive Growth in World Cities: Seizing the Opportunity, Policy Briefing 4: London Summit, World Cities Culture Forum, 2015

APPENDIX A

The CAP Report: 30 Ideas for the Creation, Activation & Preservation of Cultural Space

Certify Cultural Space

1. Certify Buildings – certification for buildings with a certain % of total sf dedicated to cultural use (modeled after LEED certification, different levels based on points)
2. Certify People – also building on the LEED model, create a certification process (requiring attendance at sessions on topics related to cultural space development). Goal is to create a network of people with shared knowledge and goals. Much like architects want to be LEED-certified, development professionals will want Cultural Space Certification as a cachet
3. Brand Cultural Space – recognition and visibility (plaque, online map) to publicize certified buildings

Code Changes

4. FAR (Floor Area Ratio) exemptions to allow additional developable sf for projects that include cultural space

5. Allow height bonuses for developments that include cultural space
6. Allow rooftop cultural spaces (an addition to current allowable rooftop uses – mechanical, communication, play equipment)
7. Add cultural spaces to the list of required uses that facades on “pedestrian-oriented streets” must have (currently retail, restaurant, etc.)
8. Create (a more easily obtained) temporary occupancy permit for pop-up cultural events *Vancouver is a case study for this one!*
9. Reclassify art galleries in Seattle’s building code classification (currently Assembly classification, rather than Mercantile classification, which leads to more expensive building requirements)

Permitting Process

10. Streamline permitting process with incentives (modeled after current Green Building permit incentive program)

11. Add Arts Office staff representation to pre-application meetings between developers and city departments to raise awareness of cultural space issues

12. Link city-websites: Arts & Culture – with Department of Construction and Inspections – with Office of Planning and Community Development

13. Create Liaison in Department of Construction and Inspections, who is knowledgeable about city building requirements and cultural space needs and can help developers create cultural space

Older Buildings

Since the vast majority of Seattle’s cultural spaces are in older buildings, there is a need to address issues (upgrading to current building codes) that complicate cultural space use of historic buildings

14. Incentivize cultural uses in older buildings through technical assistance; prioritize funds to older buildings with cultural uses

15. Relax energy and plumbing code requirements for cultural space projects in older buildings (for non-life-safety aspects)

16. Offer technical assistance to navigate level of alteration requirements (making alterations more affordable, with less than full compliance – for non-life-safety requirements), on case by case basis

Technical Assistance

17. Compile document of funding sources, grants, incentives available for cultural space projects

18. Convene hyper-local, neighborhood cultural space panels (with members certified through Cultural Space program) to advise projects

19. Increase capacity of Cultural Space Liaison to match developers with cultural users

20. Research and share models and case studies (for example in San Francisco and Brooklyn)

21. Advocate for adding support for cultural space to city’s other certification programs (for example, add cultural criteria to the city’s Living Building Challenge)

Financial Tools

22. Reduce or waive permit fees for Certified Cultural Space projects (to minimize impact on city revenue, there could be a cap on amount of reductions allowed)

23. Advocate for increased financial support for development of cultural space; making the case for arts as investment in livable city

Public Policy

24. Create a Cultural Space PDA (Public Development Authority) to lease, develop, purchase real estate for the purpose of subleasing to cultural users at subsidized rates (with suggestions for where public funding might come from to supplement rental income). [PDA is quasi-public/municipal authority created to provide public services in more flexible ways than public sector – governed by volunteer councils, appointed by mayor, receive some public funding]

25. Require cultural space in developments over 5,000sf (which is threshold to require LEED gold certification) – cultural space required as a % of total sf

26. Advocate for culture to be included in neighborhood planning tools, using neighborhood-based cultural panels

Other Ideas that can't currently be pursued (because of conflict with state constitution, and other advocacy efforts) are included to recognize input received from community outreach efforts

27. Regulate Live/Work Spaces (live/work spaces created in mixed use developments are not being used as defined)

28. Tax incentives and exemptions

29. Modify land use code for Duwamish Manufacturing Center to allow cultural uses

30. Require cultural space in private buildings that displace cultural space